



City of

Moonee Valley

Special Meeting of Council

Tuesday, 2 February 2016 at 6.30pm

Agenda

Special Meeting of Council

Tuesday, 2 February 2016 at 6.30pm
to be held at the Moonee Valley Civic Centre

TO :

Members:

Cr Andrea Surace	Mayor
Cr Paul Giuliano	
Cr Jan Chantry	
Cr Shirley Cornish	
Cr Jim Cusack	
Cr Nicole Marshall	
Cr Cam Nation	
Cr Narelle Sharpe	
Cr John Sipek	

Officers:

Mr Bryan Lancaster	Chief Executive Officer
Mr Henry Bezuidenhout	Acting Director Planning & Development
Mr Carey Patterson	Acting Director Corporate & Community Services
Mr Gil Richardson	Acting Director City Services
Ms Yvonne Hansen	Manager Legislative Services & Support

Business:

1. Opening
2. Apologies
3. Declarations of Conflict of Interest
4. Reports
 - 4.1 Proposed relocation of 'Settlers' Cottage' – 1070 Mt Alexander Road, Essendon3
5. Close of Meeting

BRYAN LANCASTER
Chief Executive Officer

REPORTS

4.1 Proposed relocation of 'Settlers' Cottage' – 1070 Mt Alexander Road, Essendon

File No: FOL/16/130
Author: Acting Manager City Planning
Directorate: Planning & Development
Ward: Buckley

Purpose

This report provides Council with options and information following the Special Council Meeting of 22 December 2015 in relation to the 'Settlers' Cottage' (Cottage) situated at 1070 Mt Alexander Road, Essendon. It also updates Council on the further investigation work Council officers have undertaken on options to temporarily relocate the Cottage, options to undertake refurbishment work to the Cottage and find a permanent location and long term use for the Cottage.

Executive Summary

- Council officers have considered options to relocate the Cottage situated at 1070 Mt Alexander Road, Essendon, while refurbishment works are carried out.
- Four potential locations were identified as a permanent location, based on the criteria to locate the Cottage on or close to Mt Alexander Road and on Council owned land. Sites considered were, Lincoln Park, Woodlands Park, Cliff Allison Reserve, and Queens Park.
- These options will be explored in more detail, including the long term use of the Cottage, following refurbishment.
- A Conservation Management Plan will be commissioned to further inform the suitability of the four preferred options and to guide the works to refurbish the Cottage.
- A temporary location for the Cottage has been identified, the Council Depot in Holmes Road.
- A visual inspection of the structure of the Cottage and accessibility of the relevant sites were undertaken from a logistical point of view.
- Council officers have held preliminary discussions with the Men's Shed Facilitator, and the Men's Shed are very interested in undertaking the refurbishment works.

Recommendation

That Council:

1. Temporarily relocate the 'Settlers' Cottage' located at 1070 Mt Alexander Road, Essendon, to the Council Depot in Holmes Road, Moonee Ponds.
2. Undertake refurbishment works to the 'Settlers' Cottage' in accordance with a Conservation Management Plan to ensure the Cottage is preserved for the enjoyment of Moonee Valley residents into the future.
3. Authorises the allocation of funds up to \$100,000 in the current financial year.
4. Receive a further report once a Conservation Management Plan is prepared and the Cottage is refurbished on options for a permanent location and use for the Cottage.

Background

A Planning Permit MV/942/2014 was issued by Council on 4 December 2015 for the demolition of an existing building at 1070 Mt Alexander Road, Essendon and construction of a five storey building within a Design and Development Overlay (DDO3) and a Heritage Overlay (HO137).

At the Special Council Meeting of 22 December 2015, Council resolved to:

1. Pursue options to temporarily relocate the 'Settlers' Cottage' located from 1070 Mt Alexander Road, Essendon.
2. Examine options to find a permanent location for the 'Settlers' Cottage' in an appropriate setting.
3. Receive a further report detailing options for permanently relocating the Settlers' Cottage, on-going maintenance costs and options to refurbish the Settlers' Cottage.

The owner of the development site where the Cottage is located is not opposed to the Cottage being relocated and will install an information plaque/interpretive display on the site once his development is complete.

The information will include, a brief written summary of the history of the Cottage, an image of the building representing its original built form and use. This interpretative signage fulfils the obligation contained in condition 3 of the planning permit.

The owner of the development site met with the Chief Executive Officer and other Council officers late last year to discuss the relocation and confirm his willingness to support this process.

The relocation of the Cottage requires a demolition permit to be issued, therefore relocating the Cottage to another site as opposed to demolishing the Cottage, is in accord with the existing Planning Permit MV/942/2014.

Discussion

Relocation costs

Council officers have undertaken a visual inspection of the Cottage and have met with the building contractor who provided Council with the original costing associated with relocating the Cottage to a nearby setting.

The initial cost estimate was not based on a detailed examination of the Cottage. The Cottage is built on timber joists and bearers which sit very close to the ground. This has led to most of the joist and bearers being rotten. This means that steel reinforcing beams will need to be put under the Cottage to maintain the integrity of the structure during transportation.

The advantage of this is that these will remain in place once the Cottage is moved to the Holmes Road Council Depot, and will make transportation to a final location much easier. Given these factors the estimate for the cost of relocation is \$63,941 (ex GST) and is shown at **Appendix A**.

Site options

Council officers have considered a number of sites where the Cottage could be moved too, either permanently or temporarily while the Cottage is restored. Considerations included proximity to the Cottage's current location, ease of access while refurbishment works are carried out, ease of refurbishment by the Men's Shed, and suitability of the relocation site as a final location for the Cottage. The following sites were considered:

- Lincoln Park
- Woodlands Park
- Cliff Allison Reserve
- Queens Park
- Holms Road Council Depot

Holmes Road Council Depot

The Holmes Road Council Depot is only a temporary location for the Cottage. The Depot is assessed to be the best location for the Cottage while refurbishment works are undertaken. The area that has been identified to the east of the current Men's Shed workshop is suitable to temporarily locate the Cottage while refurbishment works are carried out.

The area is of sufficient size, has easy access for the ingress and egress of the Cottage while refurbishment works are undertaken. A temporary construction fence can easily be erected to enclose the Cottage while the Men's Shed undertake works to the Cottage, see **Appendix B**.

Council officers have had preliminary discussions with the Men's Shed Facilitator, and the Men's Shed are very interested in undertaking the refurbishment works. The Men's Shed are keen to undertake the full refurbishment of the Cottage for the cost of materials only. A list of items that require refurbishment/replacement is listed at **Appendix C**.

Lincoln Park

Lincoln Park is located close to the current location of the Cottage at 1070 Mt Alexander Road. Logistically the Cottage could be located in Lincoln Park, however Lincoln Park is relatively isolated from the Men's Shed making it difficult at best for the Men's Shed to undertake refurbishment works.

Relocating the Cottage to Lincoln Park will require changing the Master Plan and consultation with the community before the Cottage could be relocated there.

Woodlands Park

Woodlands Park is located approximately 200m farther away from the current location of the Settlers' Cottage, than Lincoln Park. Woodlands Park contains Woodlands Park House which is available for hire through Council for birthday parties and other community uses, which are options once the refurbishment is complete; as with Lincoln Park, relocating the Cottage to Woodlands Park at this stage raise similar issues.

Cliff Allison Reserve

Cliff Allison Reserve is located approximately 200m to the west of the current location of the Cottage. There is not currently a master plan for Cliff Allison Reserve, however there is need to prepare one, and the Cottage could be included in the master plan process. Cliff Allison Reserve has attributes that would make it a potential future site for the Cottage; however as with the other locations there are limitations with locating the Cottage at Cliff Allison Reserve while refurbishment is undertaken.

Queens Park

Queens Park is the most distant of the three parks considered, at approximately 1.8km, from the Settlers' Cottage. Queens Park is Moonee Valley's finest and oldest park. Extracts from the Queens Park Master Plan state the following: *'Previous heritage studies clearly demonstrate that there are structures, elements and vegetation that have remained fairly constant over time. Establish a balance between protecting heritage elements and ensuring continued relevant contemporary use'*.

The Settlers' Cottage can be relocated to Queens Park, however it could be seen that Queens Park is at risk of becoming a 'dumping ground' for any building that Council needs to find a location for. In addition to the aforementioned as with the other possible locations there are a number of hurdles, such as modifying the master plan and access that would need to be overcome, before the Cottage can be located there.

Budget

An estimate of costs to transport the Cottage to the Council Depot in Holmes Road is \$63,941 (ex GST). The estimate of refurbishment cost \$96,500, including both labour and materials.

The cost of relocating the Cottage to a final destination is estimated to be \$15, 000, (ex GST), this figure substantially less than the initial cost to relocate the Cottage to the Depot. This is due to the fact that there is less work required to the structure of the Cottage to transport it to its final destination.

The recommendation in this report is to authorize the allocation of funds up to \$100,000, in the 2015/16 capital works budget. In addition there is a provisional

amount of \$100,000 allocated in the 2016/17 capital works budget, to complete the project.

While funds will need to be allocated in Council's annual capital works budget for costs associated with the relocation and refurbishment of the Cottage, the costs detailed at **Appendix C**, are considered as 'worst case' scenario as they include all labour costs, as well as material costs.

By utilising the Men's Shed, where only the cost of materials are involved, the cost of refurbishment can be kept to a minimum.

As discussed above the Men's Shed will provide all labour associated with the refurbishment of the Cottage, requiring Council to only fund materials and associated conservation recording.

The project would also be of benefit to the Men's Shed for both the work that the men do and the good publicity the project would generate.

Ongoing maintenance cost

It is difficult to give a precise cost for ongoing maintenance, however as general rule facility maintenance costs are in the order of 1-1.5% per annum. Given that the Cottage would be valued in the vicinity of \$250,000 once refurbished an estimated annual maintenance cost would be in the order of \$2,500-\$3,750.

Conservation Management Plan

A Conservation Management Plan (CMP) will be prepared, to guide the refurbishment process. This will be undertaken in two stages (due to the truncated timeframes associated with the relocation). Stage one will identify the significant fabric that should be conserved and protected during the transportation of the Cottage to the Holmes Road Depot. The transportation of the Cottage to the Depot will require the removal of the roofing iron and possibly some weatherboards.

The CMP will identify whether any fabric to be removed is significant and should be kept and also moved to the depot for safe-keeping (and potential future refurbishment or reconstruction), or if it is not significant (or in such poor condition that it is no longer of any use) and may be discarded.

The Stage one report will inform the preparation of the Stage two CMP, undertaken after the Cottage has been relocated to the depot. The stage two report would involve the preparation of a more comprehensive CMP, which would be prepared in accordance with the guidelines set out in the Burra Charter and Heritage Victoria's own guidelines.

The CMP would focus upon the preparation of a detailed conservation works schedule (which identifies the repairs, refurbishment or reconstruction works that would be necessary to conserve the heritage values of the Cottage), as well as principles to guide the selection of a future permanent home.

Planning Permit

The intent of issuing Planning Permit MV/942/2014 was to facilitate the construction of a five story development, including the demolition of the Settlers' Cottage. As discussed earlier in this report the relocation of the Cottage requires a demolition permit, as such whether the Cottage is removed through demolition or through

relocation, the intent of the permit is fulfilled i.e. facilitating the development of 1070 Mount Alexander Road.

Since the Special Council Meeting the applicant has applied for a Demolition Permit for the Cottage. However the applicant is willing to work with Council to facilitate relocation of the Cottage.

His reason for continuing with the steps he needs to undertake, including the demolition permit, is to facilitate the development of the site in line with his Planning Permit MV/942/2014.

Therefore relocating the Cottage to another site as opposed to demolishing the Cottage is not out of harmony with the existing Planning Permit MV/942/2014.

Final Location

There are a number of options open to Council as to where to finally relocate the Cottage. Any option that involves locating in a park will require modifying the master plan in consultation with the community.

While the refurbishment works are being undertaken these locations can be evaluated, any changes to a master plan associated with the park where the Cottage may be located can be undertaken and the community consulted. The CMP process will also help inform the final location taking into account historical principles.

Input can also be obtained from Council departments and the pros and cons of all locations thoroughly explored. Once Council officers have prepared a short list of options, a further Council report can be prepared and presented to Council for a decision on the final location.

Consultation

Council departments consulted in the preparation of this report included, City Planning, Operations, Infrastructure Services and Building, Health and Property Services.

Implications

1. Legislative

Planning Permit MV/942/2014 was issued by Council on 4 December 2015 for the demolition of an existing building and construction of a five storey building in accordance with the Planning and Environment Act 1987.

The application process and decision making is in line with the Victorian Charter of Human Rights and Responsibilities 2006 (Section 18 – Taking part in public life).

2. Council Plan / Policy

In presenting this report to Council, Council is achieving its Strategic Objective to Encourage housing development that is environmentally sustainable and caters for our diverse existing and future population in accordance with Council Plan 2013-2017 Theme 1: Sustainable living - Clear direction for growth and development of the city.

3. Financial

There is no provision made in Council's existing capital works budget to pay for relocation or refurbishment costs of the Cottage. An estimate of costs to transport the Cottage to the Council Depot in Holmes Road is \$63,941 (plus GST). The estimate of refurbishment cost \$110,500, include both labour and materials

4. Environmental

There are no further relevant environmental considerations to this report.

Conclusion

Council officers have assessed the suitability of temporarily locating the 'Settlers' Cottage' to a number of sites including the Council Depot in Holmes Road. The area identified adjacent to the Men's Shed is of suitable size, and has easy accesses to temporarily locate the Cottage while refurbishment works are undertaken by the Men's Shed.

The contractor, who supplied the original quote to Council for relocating the Cottage, has undertaken a further inspection of the Cottage and is of the opinion that the Cottage can be transported to the Council Depot in Holmes Road.

The Men's Shed are keen to undertake the refurbishment of the Cottage, which will be done for the cost of materials only, therefore reducing the financial burden on Council.

Options for the final destination and a use for the Cottage can continue to be considered in consultation with the community and Council Departments while the refurbishment works are undertaken.

Appendices

- Appendix A: Relocation cost
- Appendix B: Depot location
- Appendix C: Restoration cost

Relocation requirements	
Removal of the existing roof structure over Cottage to assist with transportation to the Depot.	
Underpin existing structure with steel framework	
Strengthen existing floor joists	
Transportation of the structure from 1070 Mt. Alexander Road to Holms Road Depot.	
Install Cottage on concrete blocks to facilitate future relocation	
Total estimate:	\$63,941 (ex GST)



Restoration Works(Including Material & labour Costs)	Costs
New concrete stump pad footings	\$9,000
New Bearers and floor joists throughout	\$3,500
Floor boards (allowed for 50% replacement)	\$3,000
Stud walls (allowed for 50% replacement)	\$4,500
Roof structure	\$3,500
Insulation	\$500
Roof sheeting (zincalume sheeting) 100 % replacement	\$5,500
Guttering and down pipes	\$1,500
Weatherboards (allow for 50% replacement)	\$4,000
New veranda structure and roof sheeting 1.5 wide	\$7,000
New brick chimney and fire place	\$8,000
New timber casement windows x 5no	\$8,000
New timber external doors x 2no	\$4,000
New timber internal doors x 2	\$1,000
New electrical wiring and switchboard Inc. lighting	\$6,000
Minor plumbing works water & drainage	\$5,000
Plasterboard sheeting to wall areas only	\$2,500
Retain and restore ceiling timber panels	\$4,000
New skirting and architraves hardwood	\$2,000
Painting throughout (internally & externally)	\$4,000
Polishing of floorboards	\$3,000
Total estimate:	\$89,500 (ex GST)
Possible additional cost post refurbishment	
Joinery / appliances to servery area (Inc. stove, cabinets, vinyl flooring, range hood)	\$7,000
Boundary fencing and gates	\$8,000
Security system	\$2,000
New mechanical split system (heating & cooling)	\$4,000
Total estimate:	\$21,000 (ex GST)